Review: [untitled]
Author(s): Sidney Ratner
Reviewed work(s): America, Britain, and Russia: Their Co-Operation and Conflict, 1941-1946 by William Hardy McNeill
Published by: American Historical Association
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/1845127

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=aha.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit organization founded in 1995 to build trusted digital archives for scholarship. We work with the scholarly community to preserve their work and the materials they rely upon, and to build a common research platform that promotes the discovery and use of these resources. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.
references or such general citations as "International Military Tribunal—Ribben-trop Testimony" or "The Nineteenth Century and After, 1944." Many direct quotations in the text as well as in the footnotes do not have citations. One of the main purposes of documentation is to act as a guide and aid to others in the field, and it would have been helpful had not so many episodes with which the author is conversant been passed over without citation. Nevertheless the book as a whole will be valued by all as a mine from which much information and assistance can be quarried.

Bowdoin College

E. C. Helmreich


This is an excellent survey of the crucially important co-operation of the United States, Great Britain, and Soviet Russia against the Axis Powers from December, 1941, to February, 1945, and of the tragic, though seemingly inevitable, breakdown of that co-operation from February, 1945, to December, 1946. The author writes with clarity and liveliness on the military, political, and economic bases of Allied co-operation, and shows great skill in presenting the plans and factors that determined the course of events. He relies exclusively upon published source-materials and the main secondary accounts available in English, French, and Italian. This limits the extent of "inside" revelations that he is able to make, but he has had the benefit of counsel from persons familiar with the events narrated, who remain anonymous, in accordance with Chatham House policy. The influence of Professor Arnold Toynbee's teachings is acknowledged.

Historians will find especially useful his lucid presentation of the complex questions affecting the conduct of the war and the postwar peace settlements. The sketches of the personal characteristics of Roosevelt, Churchill, and Stalin, and of various minor figures are vivid and suggestive, though not profound. The last chapter embodies the author's reflections on certain changes fostered by World War II: the growth of supranational administration; Britain's relative decline as a Great Power; the changed scale of international politics with the emergence of America and Russia as the super-Powers of the world; the stimulus given to the great hope for international peace, prosperity, freedom, and justice in our time; the increased power of the doctrine that social and economic relations are subject to rational control and conscious management.

Some criticisms and warnings deserve to be set down. The author strives to be impartial but reveals certain debatable presuppositions. He is a great, though occasionally critical, admirer of F.D.R. and his policies, domestic and foreign. He
Hughes: The United States and Italy

is not enthusiastic about Churchill's domestic and imperial policies. He realizes the evils and dangers of Soviet Russia's totalitarian rule but seems to admire its "achievements" in social engineering without weighing the costs or consequences as critically as a John Dewey or Bertrand Russell might. Dr. McNeill seems to be inspired by a Hegelian belief that since the Great Powers and their leaders towered over the smaller Associated Powers, one has to accept their disposal of the fate of their lesser allies, notably Poland and Nationalist China, as inevitable, as necessary evils if not positive goods. He criticizes F.D.R.'s failure to understand the Marxist outlook of Stalin (p. 565), but he himself reveals a failure to understand the consistent drive of the leaders of Soviet Russia and of the Communist International for world power. Hence he falls down in his interpretations of Soviet Russia's and Stalin's behavior and objectives throughout most of the volume, because he believes an enigma exists which a more thorough background knowledge of communist doctrine and practice would have saved him from seeing. The critical reader will want to turn for further light and correction on these matters to such works as Franz Borkenau, The Communist International, and Stefan F. Possonby, A Century of Conflict: Communist Techniques of World Revolution.

Dr. McNeill rightly questions the wisdom of F.D.R.'s insistence upon "unconditional surrender" by the Axis Powers, but fails to carry out a systematic examination of the main errors in American strategy that resulted in Soviet Russia's expansion or extension of power in eastern and central Europe and the Far East. Hanson W. Baldwin's Great Mistakes of the War rectifies the balance here. On the internal struggles for power between different groups in Washington, Eliot Janeway's The Struggle for Survival is a more reliable guide than the authorities Dr. McNeill relies upon. These deficiencies in the book under review should not obscure its many merits.

Rutgers University

SIDNEY RATNER


The conjunction between the two weighty substantives in the title of Professor Hughes's volume seems most pertinent to his major purpose. This is a fine and lively work on contemporary Italy written by a well-informed American historian for Americans. Its premise that, despite appearances, modern Italy has been something of an unknown land in urgent need of rediscovery seems almost beyond dispute. With the Second World War and the strange peace that has followed it, it has become impelling not only for intellectual but also for high political purposes that the real truth be sought, that image and reality attain less than an occasional or coincidental resemblance. This book is a very serious and successful effort toward achieving that end.